

DESIGN WITH NATURE NOW CONTRIBUTION COVER PAGE

Title:

Ian Lennox McHarg, Scotland and the Emergence of Green Consciousness

Author:

Brian Mark Evans
Professor of Urbanism and Landscape
Mackintosh School of Architecture
The Glasgow School of Art

ABSTRACT

This essay seeks to place Ian Lennox McHarg and *Design With Nature* in contemporary and Scottish contexts. It reflects on the green consciousness of Scottish traditions and sets McHarg alongside his fellow internationally renowned and environmentally conscious Scots: John Muir and Patrick Geddes. It is suggested that the migration of dispossessed highlanders to Glasgow brought this culture to the city and this has, in turn, informed the emergence of bio-regionalism and green consciousness in Scotland. McHarg's contribution to the early days of this movement is noted as is the significance of his work in informing the school of landscape thought (in the UK and Scotland in particular) that is rooted in regionalism, terrain, ecology and nature. Finally the text refers to the work in Scotland of graduates from McHarg's landscape programs at the University of Pennsylvania and concludes that they in turn refreshed the Design With Nature methodology and re-invigorated subsequent generations of landscape planners and landscape architects in Scotland.

Mailing Address:

7 Seyton Court, Seyton Avenue
Giffnock
Glasgow G46 6QA
Scotland UK

Telephone:

T: +44 (0) 141 620 1518

M: +44 (0) 7801 495155

Email:

b.evans@gsa-urbanism.org

POSSIBLE FIGURES

Figure 8.1: Photograph of Jacobs, McHarg, Lynch et al

Figure 8.2: John Muir, Patrick Geddes and Ian McHarg

Figure 8.3: The Clyde Valley Regional Plan 1946

Figure 8.4: The Central Scotland Green Network

Figure 8.5: The landscape plan for the expansion of Moscow

8. Ian Lennox McHarg, Scotland and the Emergence of Green Consciousness

Brian M. Evans

The Royal Mile extends from Edinburgh Castle to the Palace of Holyrood. It is Scotland's *Panatheaic Way* and was redolent of imperialism—from military to monarchy—until the insinuation of the new Scottish Parliament in 1999 introduced a distinctive and democratic 'discontinuity'.¹ The principal entrance to Scotland's Parliament sits in direct juxtaposition with the regal entry to Holyrood. On the elevation to the Royal Mile, in the approach to the entrance for MSPs, the words of a famous few Scots are cut into the stone to remind those of whom they serve when going about the business of government.²

There are words and stones from authors, entrepreneurs, philosophers, and poets.³ Sir Walter Scott's words observe that politicians kept close at hand are easier to hold to account. But his most famous quote, that somehow captures the way that many, then and now, feel comfortable in expressing a view about Scotland, is missing: "*Breathes there the man with soul so dead/Who never to himself hath said/This is mine own, my native land! .../Oh Caledonia, stern and wild/milk nurse for a poetic child.*"⁴

This essay explores the relationship between Ian Lennox McHarg and the environmental consciousness of Scotland, the country where he was born, schooled, and lived before European conflict took him away to soldier for King and Country—a challenge to which he responded with some distinction—and until his first sojourn in the United States to Harvard University that changed the course of his life.⁵

Five thinker-scholar-practitioners each published a seminal work in the 1960s and changed forever the way we think about and practice urbanism. The *primus inter pares* of the group is Jane Jacobs and her masterwork *The Death and Life of Great American Cities*; the others comprise *The Image of the City* (Kevin Lynch); *Townscape* (Gordon Cullen); *Design of Cities* (Edmund Bacon), and, for those who begin with the land, Ian McHarg's *Design With Nature*.⁶

This is a personal view. There are notable omissions—Lewis Mumford for example—but, as an aspirant thinker-scholar-practitioner working in the inter-twinned fields of urbanism and landscape design, these 'Famous Five' acted as the progenitors for late twentieth century urbanism that enabled a step change in empirical, rational, and pragmatic thought applied to City and Landscape Planning and Design.⁷

They gave us the basic tools to understand the socio-economic realities of the city (Jacobs), its experiential qualities (Lynch), the observational skills needed (Cullen), the orthography of the city (Bacon), and in *Design With Nature*, the natural and

ecological qualities. They knew one another, shared and collaborated. An iconic photograph from 1959 shows McHarg with Jacobs and Lynch and many other notable contemporaries including Lewis Mumford, J.B. Jackson, Catherine Bauer, and Louis Kahn.⁸ Cullen and Bacon are missing from the photograph, but Bacon taught for many years at the University of Pennsylvania and Cullen was also on the faculty after McHarg invited him to teach there.⁹ (Figure 8.1: Photograph of Jacobs, McHarg, Lynch et al)

Urban and landscape thought, research, and practice have evolved since the publication of these books. However, the contention may be made that the foundation of more recent, leading contributions can be tracked back to these five principal texts: whether that be the legacy of Kevin Lynch for Jan Gehl or Ian McHarg for Michael Hough. This does not, however, suggest that Gehl and Hough are derivative of Lynch and McHarg any more than McHarg is derivative of Patrick Geddes.¹⁰ Here then is a personal view of the key thinkers that established the intent of late 20th century urban thought and practice placing McHarg and *Design With Nature* at its core.

Like the *first nations* of many countries, the Celts of Scotland (and Ireland) had a predominantly oral culture with law and traditions entrusted to the *seanchaidh* (English – *shanachie*) – part storyteller, part historian, and part shaman.¹¹ Today a substantive literature exists on the antecedents and legacy of Celtic and Gaelic culture in Scotland notably in associations with land and environment.¹²

An enduring theme in the narrative between landscape and environment lies in the distinction between *land* and *the land*. In his musings on the subject in *Second Nature*, Michael Pollan distinguishes between the developer's love of *land*, as distinct from *the land*, for “*the land is abstract and in some final sense unpossessable by any individual*” whereas “*land is a reliable if somewhat mystical source of private wealth ... to hold and multiply in value.*”¹³

This distinction goes to the heart of Celtic and Scottish sensibilities about environment and land. It is a recurrent theme in Celtic poetry and folklore and is further evoked and developed in the canon of Scottish literature as exemplified by the likes of Lewis Grassie Gibbon encapsulated in the quotation “*Nothing endures ... but the land*”.¹⁴ Norman MacCaig, renowned poet and chronicler of the Gaelic traditions of Scotland, wrote: “*Who possesses this landscape?/The man who bought it or I who am possessed by it?/False questions, for this landscape is masterless/and intractable in any terms that are human.*”¹⁵

There is a distinction in the timeframes of these different approaches to land where one is driven by short-term financial motivation and the other by protracted geological horizons. But it is the ‘commodification’ of land, rather than an inherited

appreciation of natural and social good, that is the most immediate difference between these cultural approaches.

In the United Kingdom and in British history, this difference between *land* and *the land* is a fault line that distinguished Celtic and Anglo-Saxon attitudes to the social, economic, and cultural appreciation of territory. This distinction was at its most pronounced during the *Highland Clearances* in Scotland (and similar indignities in Ireland)—Britain’s own program of ethnic cleansing.¹⁶ The Clearances were not the first, nor the last, systemic displacement of *first nations* in the name of progress and exploitation of land rather than living with it in an harmonious balance, but for any scholar of the Scottish history and landscape, they are the most real, the tangible evidence that brother can prey on brother for the lure of perceived economic advantage – a disparity apparent in the political ideologies of social democracy and neoliberal capitalism.

In his lecture to the British Academy in 1990, Chris Smout explored the (Scottish) Highlands and the roots of green consciousness.¹⁷ Smout, like John Muir, Patrick Geddes, and Ian McHarg before him, has written about green consciousness emerging in terms of human relationships with the land, its use and management, and how this enters art, culture, and poetry. In his writings, Smout set out the attitudes to landscape and the environment (predominantly in respect of the Highlands of Scotland) as ‘traditional’—a resource for living (farming and forestry), a resource for sport (huntin’, shootin’, and fishin’) and a resource for industry (mining, smelting, and power); and ‘post-romantic’—a resource for outdoor recreation, spiritual contemplation, and a refuge for nature. Smout was one of the first in the UK, on the cusp of the twenty-first century, to observe the transition in green thinking from the romantic views of nature in the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries through the scientific analysis and taxonomy of the nineteenth and twentieth centuries on to emergence into the political mainstream in the late twentieth and early twenty-first centuries—a journey increasingly seen as essential to address the threats of global population growth and climate change foreseen by Muir, Geddes, and McHarg, three native Scots who have had a global impact on environmental consciousness.

Muir was born in Dunbar, Scotland in 1838 and eleven years later his family moved to Wisconsin bringing with it Scottish attitudes to the land and to hard work, a quality shared by many pioneer immigrants and one frequently referred to by McHarg himself.¹⁸ Muir and McHarg were inspired by the landscape of the United States and seized the opportunities presented there, but it may be suggested, particularly in McHarg’s case, that the cultural context and environmental awareness that they grew up with had a lasting effect on the attitudes they carried with them and the subsequent exploration of opportunities presented to them.¹⁹

Unlike Muir and McHarg who emigrated to America by default and by choice respectively, Patrick Geddes, originally from the village of Ballater in the north east

of Scotland (born 1858), remained in the UK, studied in London and achieved great prominence nationally and internationally to become widely recognized as one of the founders of town planning.²⁰ Geddes advocated the unity of city and region as the basis for town and country planning and explored these ideas at the Cities and Town-Planning Exhibition of 1911, later published in the book *Cities in Evolution* in 1915.²¹

Geddes proposition of a journey from *eotechnic* (pre-industrial *life in balance* with nature) to *paleotechnic* (the *life threatening* industrial age of exploitation and city growth) to *neotechnic* (*life insurgent* and transition to a healthy environment with newer cleaner technologies) was initially seen as utopian but has since come to be appreciated as expressing the antecedents of sustainability — a proposition explored in *Dear Green Place: A Question of Equilibrium*, the theme of the UK pavilion at XVIII Triennale di Milano *Life between Life Between Artifact and Nature: Design and the Environmental Challenge* in 1992.²²

The review and reappraisal of Geddes' ideas has been more or less continuous since the late 20th century as the evolution in urban and landscape thought described in the first part of this essay have worked through the system and research and practice has sought a means to integrate the ideas first espoused by Jacobs, Lynch, Cullen, Bacon, and McHarg into a more holistic approach to urbanism. In *Planning living cities: Patrick Geddes' legacy in the new millennium*, the issue of *Landscape and Urban Planning* edited by Young and Clavel, a collection of essays discuss the strengths and weaknesses of Geddes' ideas.²³ For example Batty and Marshall highlight Geddes' introduction of the theory of evolution to city planning which he migrated into social evolution with inherent contradictions and tension between 'bottom-up' and 'top-down' action. Nonetheless they conclude that the enduring appeal of Geddes is that he left, albeit incomplete, the expression of a "*big picture in a way that later generations could easily grasp and build upon*" while revealing the "*key paradox of modern planning which seeks to intervene in systems that have enormous complexity, growing and evolving rather than being designed in any top-down fashion*". But, as Weller suggests "*the study of cities was, for Geddes, ultimately a means to study and advance life.*"²⁴

In terms of this narrative that concerns green consciousness, Geddes contribution is clear as Steiner and McSherry assert:

"The hill and valley landscapes of Scotland influenced how Patrick Geddes viewed cities and regions. His theories were grounded in interdisciplinarity and visual thinking and produced enduring tools still used by planners and designers, such as transects, diagnostic surveys, and conservative surgery. ... His ideas in turn influenced other important planning theorists such as Lewis Mumford, Jaqueline Tyrwhitt, and Ian McHarg and remain timely and useful for contemporary regional planning, urban design, and landscape

architecture. ... The theories of Patrick Geddes continue to be relevant for cities in evolution."

Lewis Mumford was influenced by Geddes work and did a great deal to promote it in the USA. Geddes work predates McHarg's but does not, as Anne Whiston Spirn argues, "*diminish McHarg's contribution.*"²⁵ Spirn posits several reasons for "*the failure to appreciate the importance of Geddes's work as a precedent*" including "*the desire to be seen as original is typical of landscape architects*" and she has established that Geddes' papers were lodged at the Glasgow College of Art (sic) when McHarg returned to Scotland to teach there in 1952.²⁶ The exact nature of any influence, however, is not the central issue here. It is rather to establish a patrimonial link between three of the world's leading environmentalists—John Muir, Patrick Geddes, and Ian McHarg—who emerged from Scotland and have developed ideas that resonate with, and emerge from, Scottish attitudes to the land, to environment and the landscape in what Chris Smout has described as an emerging *green consciousness*. (Figure 8.2: John Muir, Patrick Geddes, and Ian McHarg).

All three came from a cultural landscape tradition where the appreciation of place is rooted in its relationship with the land—of the land—and with a deep respect for it and the traditions derived from it—the '*dualchas*' of Scots Gaelic for which there is but a transliteration from Gaelic to English.²⁷ '*Dualchas*' connotes that part of the patrimony that somehow conveys physical character, heritage, culture, and tradition akin to the polyvalence currently devoted to 'place' as a concept and used today in "*dualchas àraid agus luachmhòr ann*—a unique and valued heritage."²⁸ The closest contemporary usage comes in the German '*heimat*,' which carries the same allusion to 'place' and 'home'.

It is unknown how much, if any, knowledge of the Gaelic language was known to Muir or McHarg although Geddes did have some awareness. It is clear, however, that all three shared a love and understanding of and empathy with the land that is commonplace in many aboriginal societies and certainly clear in the Celtic and Gaelic affinity that continues to permeate contemporary Scots culture. *The land* has been eulogised in Gaelic and Scots literature for centuries.²⁹ Scotland is the only part of the UK to have an *everyman's right, a freedom to roam*.³⁰ As McHarg observed: "*Scotland has no law of trespass, so the countryside (is) fissured by rights-of-way.*"³¹

The Highland Clearances displaced many thousands of highland people in a widespread diaspora to North America but also to the burgeoning industrial city of Glasgow that became and remains, with Manchester, Birmingham, one of a very few metropolitan cities in the UK outside of London.³² All of these cities are or have been destinations for successive waves of immigration, what Doug Saunders has described as 'arrival cities'.³³ Among these British metropolitan cities, Glasgow is unique in the proportion of its population that is of 'Highland' Scot (significantly west as much as

north) and Irish extraction – a tradition that McHarg himself hails from.³⁴ In this respect, and sparing Dublin’s blushes, Glasgow is the greatest Celtic city in the world.

It was to Glasgow that the Highland and Irish dispossessed arrived in numbers almost as great as to the New World. In turn they provided the muscle and canny intelligence to support the creation of an industrial behemoth that had had its beginnings in the visionary settlement of New Lanark in the upper reaches of the River Clyde and became the ‘workshop of the world’ and the ‘second city of empire’ – shibboleths both and now reviled in Glasgow for many reasons mainly to do with the exploitation of indigenous Scots and colonial peoples.^{35,36}

The first industrial expansion of Glasgow was populated by these displaced Highland and Irish peoples and their culture, values, and humour pervaded the burgeoning Glasgow working class. Gaelic was widely spoken and even today, Glasgow’s links with the highland and islands of Scotland and with Ireland north and south are pronounced.³⁷ Attitudes to the land and the environment were embodied in this new urban culture, they are transcendental and remain evident today and are evident in McHarg’s own recollections in *A Quest for Life* “... a beautiful and powerful landscape contrasted with a mean ugly city ... Nature was freedom ... I was born and bred on a fulcrum ... city and countryside.”³⁸ Reading the literature and speaking with those who knew him, it is perhaps glib but nonetheless accurate to assert the old aphorism that ‘you can take the boy out of Glasgow, but you can’t take Glasgow out of the boy’.³⁹

There is a cultural and intellectual link between this Celtic/Gaelic legacy, perhaps an attitude of mind, and bio-regionalism in Scotland. The tradition of regional planning in the west of Scotland is strong and continuous since the publication of the Clyde Valley Regional Plan in 1946 led by Sir Patrick Abercrombie (influenced by Geddes) and assisted by the young Robert Grieve who went on to become Scotland’s Chief Planner, Professor of Town and Regional Planning at the University of Glasgow and was knighted as the founding Chair of the Highlands and Islands Development Board (Figure 8.3: The Clyde Valley Regional Plan 1946).⁴⁰

As a teenager McHarg met Grieve returning to Glasgow from walking in the Scottish countryside dwelling for stories at meeting places and bothys.⁴¹ Later, after graduating from Harvard, McHarg worked for Grieve in the Government in Scotland and viewed him at a distance and with some considerable respect.⁴² So McHarg knew *The Clyde Valley Regional Plan*, knew Grieve personally, and recognized the influence of Geddes “the brilliant mind of ... biologist-turned planner) ... fascinating but difficult to read”.⁴³ During his early years in Scotland, McHarg was asked to look at aspects of implementing the Clyde Valley Regional Plan including the siting of Cumbernauld New Town.⁴⁴ McHarg’s contribution inspired William Gillespie appointed as the new

town's chief landscape architect who went on to found Gillespies, subsequently one of the UK's most prominent landscape practices.⁴⁵

The Clyde Valley Regional Plan of 1946 was revisited in the West Central Scotland Plan of 1974 and became the talisman for the Strathclyde Structure Plan of 1976 (in several editions) and latterly the Glasgow and Clyde Valley Strategic Plan from 1996 until its most recent iteration in 2017. Along the way, informal strategies including the *Strathclyde River Valleys Strategy* and *Greening the Conurbation* and the *Central Scotlands Woodland Project* became the antecedent of today's *Central Scotland Green Network*, one of fourteen national priority projects in Scotland's *National Planning Framework*.⁴⁶

Clearly, the condition of his native city and its surrounding landscape spurred McHarg's thinking and ideas. He was not alone, and many with influence such as Sir Robert Grieve and William Gillespie shared his concern. Eventually they and their ilk gained an upper hand in the environmental, landscape and heritage regeneration of Glasgow in successive waves in the 1970s, 1980s, and 1990s undertaken by individuals and practices inspired Geddes and by McHarg, by *Design With Nature* and by the techniques it espouses to help turn a city that McHarg had described as "... one of the meanest of industrial cities" to become "nominated in 1992 (sic) as the European city of culture – quite a transformation from the days of my boyhood".⁴⁷

The degraded landscape of central Scotland has seen remarkable **remediation** (of land and the cleansing of pollutants), **renewal** (of the land surface through landscape enhancement), **regeneration** (of the built heritage and fabric), and **renaissance** (of communities and their social fabric) through a series of initiatives originating with the land reclamation program of the Scottish Development Agency in the 1970s and 1980s.⁴⁸

The *Central Scotland Woodlands Project* begun in 1975, which became the *Central Scotland Forest* and finally, in 2011, the *Central Scotland Green Network*, a £2.5bn project for greening the central valley of Scotland from Ayrshire to Fife and the Lothians (Figure 8.5: the Central Scotland Green Network).⁴⁹ The first chair of this initiative was Robert (Bob) Steedman, one of McHarg's first alumni who worked for Wallace-McHarg Associates in the early 1960s.⁵⁰

Much of this work may not have been delivered as early as McHarg might have wished when lamenting the failure of the Government's Department of Health to immediately take up his ideas (and well before *Design With Nature*), but, in the fullness of time, it has become one of the most strategic and consistent application of the ideas of *Design With Nature* anywhere.⁵¹

Ian McHarg trained many the UK's finest landscape architects of the 20th Century and his legacy continues to inspire the next generation today.⁵² Scotland was also a beneficiary of McHarg's pedagogic diaspora some of whom made a significant contribution to establishing the ideas of *Design With Nature* in Scotland. McHarg makes several references to James (Jim) Morris and Robert (Bob) Steedman, two of his first intake at Penn, in *A Quest for Life*.⁵³ The University of Pennsylvania holds a list of this group of alumni many of whom formed influential alliances and practices in the UK. Like both Morris and Steedman, (Wilson) Mark Turnbull (graduated 1970) first studied and later worked with McHarg on assembling *Design With Nature*.⁵⁴

There are numerous examples in this volume that are testament to the influence of McHarg's alumni globally. Steedman and Turnbull have had a profound and lasting impact on the theory and practice of landscape architecture, planning, and design in contemporary Scotland. Both Steedman and Turnbull were appointed to the Royal Fine Art Commission for Scotland (RFACS) and the Countryside Commission for Scotland (CCS), the only two architect/landscape architects to hold the distinction of being a commissioner of both during the existence of these organisations.⁵⁵ As Fine Art and Countryside Commissioners, Steedman and Turnbull exerted considerable sway on the built and natural environments of Scotland in the thirty years from the 1970s until the 1990s. They were both influential in the debate around some of the most pressing matters of the time including the establishment of guidelines to incorporate industrial infrastructure into Scotland's landscape after the discovery of North Sea Oil in the 1970s, the development of a park system for Scotland (in 1970s), and the intense debate leading to the establishment of Scotland's first national parks in 2002.⁵⁶

During periods of collaboration between the author and both Steedman and Turnbull, a theoretical and practical understanding of the techniques of *Design With Nature* was developed and later, when working in developing countries, this experience provided the basis for landscape planning using McHarg's method applied to new settlements employing ecological, landscape and environmental principles of design, notably in Russia and China. The culmination of this effort came in 2012, when the Anglo-American team led by Urban Design Associates and Gillespies was joint winner of the international competition for the expansion of Moscow. Held by the Federal Government of Russia and the City Mayor, the international jury commended the team and their entry for the understanding of, and a designed response to, the environment, ecology and landscape of the Moscow Region as a key to the team's success (Figure 8.5: The landscape plan for the expansion of Moscow).⁵⁷

Retrospect and Prospect

Did McHarg ever look at Scotland and think wistfully in Scott's words "*this is mine own, my native land*". In his own words and in the views of those who know him and worked with him the answer is an emphatic 'yes'.⁵⁸ *A Quest for Life* is riddled with proclamations to that effect. But ultimately McHarg never returned nor practiced in Scotland after his early years and he saw himself as – and was – a Scots American.⁵⁹ The narrative in this essay gives rise to some immodest claims. But none seek to reclaim Ian McHarg for Scotland. Nonetheless there is an argument presented here that Scottish, and in particular Celtic/Gaelic, culture has given America and the world three hugely influential sons who have, together with their cultural antecedents provided more impetus than many nations – large and small – to the emergence of green consciousness.

Ian McHarg is part of the pantheon of thinkers and practitioners that changed urban thought in the late 20th century. More than John Muir, less perhaps than Patrick Geddes, McHarg's awareness of the Scottish land and culture pervaded his thought and together with Muir and Geddes represents a remarkable global contribution to environmental awareness and green consciousness born of traditions and culture founded in aboriginal, Celtic, Gaelic, and Scottish precepts concerning the land.

Scotland can be slow to recognize its children who make a contribution on the world stage. It took time for Patrick Geddes and Charles Rennie Mackintosh to become appreciated and then only after world acclaim. Thankfully today, we have *The John Muir Trail* that leads from his birthplace to *Loch Lomond and the Trossachs* Scotland's first national park. It is to be hoped that the events of 2019 will help to stimulate a similar public awareness of Ian Lennox McHarg to match his professional recognition and legacy.

McHarg emerged from a city, region, and nation that was in trauma from the Great Depression and World War II. His appreciation of the environment from the region to the garden echoes Geddes and has in the last thirty years been paralleled at home where his native Glasgow has been transformed from industrial to post-industrial city and now moves towards a proto-knowledge city that is becoming worthy of its Gaelic name *Gleschu* (dear green place).

There is a multi-stranded helix of historical and contemporary experience in this narrative: the traditions of Scotland that influenced Muir, Geddes, and McHarg; the bio-regionalism of the west of Scotland; McHarg's influence on his native land through his Scottish alumni; the largest greening project in Europe; and, in the developing world, the transformation of Moscow.

McHarg's graduates have re-invigorated his beliefs and his work at home, and inspired the next generation of individuals and projects—one such, the Central

Scotland Green Network, is one of fourteen national priorities. Today, and at last, Scotland is designing with nature now. Perhaps at some point in the future, McHarg's words, like Muir and Mackintosh, might be cut into the stones of Edinburgh.

*"Let us hope that in the next century the finest accomplishment of art will be the restoration of **the land**."*⁶⁰

¹ The Scottish Parliament was opened on 12th May 1999 (in a temporary home in the headquarters of the Church of Scotland with the words of Dr. Winifred [Winnie] Ewing: "... the Scottish Parliament, which adjourned on March 25, 1707, is hereby reconvened." (http://news.bbc.co.uk/democracylive/hi/historic_moments/newsid_8187000/8187312.stm).

Use of the word 'discontinuity' is deliberate and echoes the geological concept of 'unconformity' first observed and described by the Scottish geologist Hugh Millar to explain the discontinuity in layers of rock from different eras (<http://www.cromartyartstrust.org.uk/userfiles/file/Celebrating%20Hugh%20Miller%20sm.pdf>).

The Scottish Parliament has created an *unconformity* in post-imperial British politics and one that McHarg might have appreciated given the geological reference and his penchant for referring to the classical St Andrew's House in Edinburgh that housed the civil service in Scotland as "*the home of Scotland's puppet government*". McHarg, I. 1996, *A Quest for Life*, Wiley, p94.

² Members of the Scottish Parliament.

³ For example: Robert Louis Stevenson, Alastair Gray, Andrew Carnegie, Hugh MacDiarmid, Norman MacCaig, Robert Burns, Charles Rennie Mackintosh - <http://www.parliament.scot/visitandlearn/21013.aspx>

⁴ The quotation is from the first stanza from the poem 'The lay of the Last Minstrel', Canto VI [My Native Land], Sir Walter Scott's paean to Scottish patriotism published in 1805 in which in which Scott makes allusion to his country and traditions.

⁵ McHarg, I. 1996, *A Quest for Life*, Wiley, Chapter 2. Some care is needed in drawing quotations from autobiographies that can, on occasion, be the subject of fickle recall or wishful interpretation by the author. McHarg's own contains more than a few obvious inaccuracies, including *inter alia* consistently misrepresenting The Glasgow School of Art as Glasgow College of Art, an institution where he studied (1936) and later taught for three years (from 1952). In this essay, however, the references to McHarg's account focus on passages where he is expressing recollection of feeling or sentiment and/or his opinions on aspects of his native city and country.

⁶ Jacobs, J., *The Death and Life of Great American Cities*, Random House, 1961; Lynch, K., *The Image of the City*, The MIT Press, 1960; Bacon, E., *Design of Cities*, Thames & Hudson, 1961; Cullen, G., *Townscape*, The Architectural Press, 1961; McHarg, I.L., *Design With Nature*, the Natural History Press for the American Museum of Natural History, 1969.

⁷ British children from the post-WWII era grew up reading Enid Blyton's 'Famous Five' adventure stories for children published by Hodder & Stoughton.

The books feature five children who go camping in nature, hiking, or on holiday together elsewhere. The settings, however, are almost always rural and set with the simple joys of cottages, islands, the countryside, and sea shores, as well as an outdoor life of picnics, lemonade, bicycle trips, and swimming. These fanciful stories instilled in the post-war generation a love of the outdoors and a compulsion in later life to take any opportunity to group things into five.

⁸ Photograph by Grady Clay from *Architecture*, January 1959 taken by Grady Clay showing *inter alia*, Lewis Mumford, Ian McHarg, J.B. Jackson, Louis Kahn, etc. Architectural Archives of the University of Pennsylvania.

⁹ Anne Whiston Spirn, "Ian McHarg, Landscape Architecture, and Environmentalism: Ideas and Methods in Context" in offprint from *Environmentalism in Landscape Architecture*, Volume 22, Conan, Michel (editor), Dumbarton Oaks Research Library and Collection, Washington, D.C., 2000 p101 (and also *A Quest for Life* p167).

¹⁰ *Ibid*, p102.

¹¹ Shanachie is the English version of the Scots Gaelic *seanchaidh* (plural *seanchaidhean*). In ancient Celtic culture, the history and laws of the people were not written down but memorized in long lyric poems which were recited by bards in a tradition echoed by the *seanchaidhean*.

¹² See for example the books of: James Hunter including *Last of the Free: A History of the Highlands and Islands* (1999), *Scottish Exodus: Travels Among a Worldwide Clan* (2005), *Set Adrift Upon the World – The Sutherland Clearances* (2016); Edward Cowan, *Scottish History: The Power of the Past* (2002); Gordon Donaldson, *Scotland: The Shaping of a Nation* (1974) and *Scotland and Norway – a northern commonwealth* (1990).

¹³ Pollan, M., 1996, *Second Nature: A Gardener's Education*, Bloomsbury, p12.

¹⁴ From the novel *Sunset Song*, Lewis Grassie Gibbon (1932). It is widely regarded as one of the most important Scottish novels of the 20th century and the first part of a trilogy *A Scots Quair*.

¹⁵ Norman MacCaig (1910 - 1996), *A Man in Assynt*, Bressay Sandstone from the Shetland Islands inset into the Canongate Wall.

¹⁶ Hunter, Op. cit.

¹⁷ T C Smout is the Historiographer Royal in Scotland, Professor Emeritus St Andrews University and former Deputy Chair of Scottish Natural Heritage. See Chris Smout, *Occasional Paper No 1 – The Highlands and the Roots of Green Consciousness, 1750–1990* (1990). This essay is the text of the Raleigh Lecture on British History, delivered at the University of Glasgow on 24 October 1990 as part of Glasgow's European City of Culture celebrations and again at the British Academy in London on 20 November 1990. <http://www.snh.gov.uk/publications-data-and-research/publications>

¹⁸ See for example Muir, J., (1913), *The Story of My Boyhood and Youth* and McHarg, I. (1996) *A Quest for Life Chapter 1*. And in conversation with those who knew and studied with McHarg: for example, Dean Frederick Steiner, McHarg collaborator, and Robert Steedman, McHarg alumnus.

¹⁹ In the early chapters of *A Quest for life* (pp 13-16), McHarg makes frequent reference to the qualities of nature in the localities close to his boyhood home, learning to live *free off the land, walking many miles each day through forests of beech, mountain ash, pine and larch with water margins of flag iris with rich insect and bird life*.

²⁰ See for example Goist, P., (1974) Patrick Geddes and the City, *Journal of the American Institute of Planners*, Volume 40, 1974 - Issue 1 and:

<https://www.mackintosh-architecture.gla.ac.uk/catalogue/name/?nid=GeddPat>

<https://www.historyscotland.com/articles/on-this-day-in-history/scottish-sociologist-and-town-planner-patrick-geddes-was-born-on-this>

<https://www.britannica.com/biography/Patrick-Geddes>

<https://www.undiscoveredscotland.co.uk/usbiography/g/patrickgeddes.html>

²¹ Geddes, P. 1915. *Cities in Evolution: an introduction to the town planning movement and to the study of civics*, Williams.

²² Evans, B., Galloway, M., Mackinnon, J., Refern, A., Urquhart, G., (1992). "Dear Green Place: A Question of Equilibrium" in *La vita tra cose e natura: il progetto e la sfida ambientale* (Life Between Artifact and Nature: Design and the Environmental Challenge), Catalogue of the 18th International Triennale of Milan, Electa, 1992.

²³ Young, R. & Clavel, P. (editors), *Landscape and Urban Planning*, Special Issue: Planning living cities: Patrick Geddes' legacy in the new millennium, Volume 166, Pages 1-110 (October 2017)

²⁴ Batty, M. & Marshall, S, *Thinking organic, acting civic: The paradox of planning for Cities in Evolution* and Weller, V., *Commentary on "Thinking organic, acting civic: The paradox of planning for cities in evolution"* by Michael Batty and Stephen Marshall, and "Jaqueline Tyrwhitt translates Patrick Geddes for post world war two planning" by Ellen Shoshkes in Young, R. & Clavel, P. (editors), *Landscape and Urban Planning*, Special Issue: Planning living cities: Patrick Geddes' legacy in the new millennium, Volume 166, Pages 1-110 (October 2017).

²⁵ Spirn, A.W, 2002, Op. cit. p102

²⁶ A note on nomenclature. In a *Quest for Life*, McHarg records his time with Glasgow College of Art, but the Institution is and always has been known as the Glasgow School of Art (GSA). A mix-up perhaps with his time at Edinburgh College of Art (now ESALA – Edinburgh School of Architecture and Landscape Architecture. ESALA is now a school with the University of Edinburgh whereas GSA remains an independent institution whose degrees

are accredited by the senate of the University of Glasgow. Scotland's two premier art institutions are therefore underpinned by the imprimatur of the Russell Group of research Universities in the United Kingdom.

²⁷ As with many ancient language usage, 'dualchas' there can only be a transliteration from Gaelic to English. 'Dualchas' connotes that part of the patrimony that somehow conveys physical character, heritage, culture and tradition akin to the polyvalence currently devoted to 'place' as a concept. The closest contemporary usage comes in the German 'heimat' which carries the same allusion to 'place' and to 'home'.

²⁸ From the lyrics of Runrig a prominent Scottish folk-rock band who sing in both Gaelic and English.

²⁹ Robert Burns, Walter Scott, Hugh MacDiarmid, Norman McCaig and Lewis Grassie Gibbon are among the best known

³⁰ The freedom to roam, or "everyman's right", is the general public's right to access certain public or privately owned land for recreation and exercise. The right is sometimes called the right of public access to the wilderness or the "right to roam". In Scotland, the Nordic countries of Finland, Iceland, Norway and Sweden, the Baltic countries of Estonia, Latvia and Lithuania and the Central European countries of Austria, Czech Republic and Switzerland, the freedom to roam takes the form of general public rights which are sometimes codified in law. The access is ancient in parts of Northern Europe and has been regarded as sufficiently basic that it was not formalised in law until modern times. However, the right usually does not include any substantial economic exploitation, such as hunting or logging, or disruptive activities, such as making fires and driving offroad vehicles.

³¹ McHarg, I., (1996) *A Quest for Life*, John Wiley & Sons, p15

³² The most appropriate definition of 'metropolitan' in the UK is provided by the Centre for Cities who have defined the Primary Urban Area as a measure of the "built-up" area of a city, rather than individual local authority districts (<http://www.centreforcities.org/puas/>).

³³ Sanders, D., *Arrival City: How the Largest Migration in History Is Reshaping Our World*. The largest migration in human history is under way. For the first time ever, more people are living in cities than in rural areas. Between 2007 and 2050, the world's cities will have absorbed 3.1 billion people. Urbanization is the mass movement that will change our world during the twenty-first century, and the 'arrival city' is where it is taking place.

From the flyleaf: "*The arrival city exists on the outskirts of the metropolis, in the slums, or in the suburbs; the American version is New York's Lower East Side of a century ago or today's Herndon County, Virginia. These are the places where newcomers try to establish new lives and to integrate themselves socially and economically. Their goal is to build communities, to save and invest, and, hopefully, move out, making room for the next wave of migrants. For some, success is years away; for others, it will never come at all.*"

³⁴ *A Quest for Life* – Chapter 1

³⁵ New Lanark lies on the River Clyde, harnessing water power and was founded in 1786 by David Dale who worked with his son-in-law Robert Owen to create an industrial model village with enlightened employment conditions. Owen later became involved in the establishment of New Harmony in Indiana, USA.

³⁶ See for example Oakley, C.A., 1967. *The Second City*, Blackie & Sons. Once a source of great pride, the twin epithets of 'second city of empire' and 'workshop of the world' have become less favored in 21st century through the widening realization that the 'wealth of empire' was founded on exploitation of peoples and countries and on the slave trade as well as extracting a great price from Glasgow in terms of the state of its environment and the health of its people. In common with others cities of the UK and the USA, there is greater humility and contrition in this realisation today.

³⁷ There are numerous trusts and spiritual organisations that work with these communities. See for example the Iona Community (<https://iona.org.uk> and the Galgael Trust (<https://www.galgael.org>).

³⁸ *A Quest for Life* p15.

³⁹ One of McHarg's first students at Penn was Robert (Bob) Russell Steedman, recruited from the Edinburgh College of Art who first studied at Penn and later worked for Wallace-McHarg Associates. Steedman recalls McHarg as an "*archetypal blunt and charismatic Glaswegian*". Interview with Bob Steedman at the Scottish Parliament 6 June 2018.

⁴⁰ The Clyde Valley Regional Plan was published in 1946 and was reprinted in 1996 to celebrate its 50th anniversary and the 20th anniversary of the Strathclyde Structure Plan.

⁴¹ *A Quest for Life* p15, p16.

⁴² *Ibid*, p16.

⁴³ *Ibid*, p 93 and p112.

⁴⁴ *A Quest for Life* p113.

⁴⁵ The landscape architect William Gillespie was appointed Chief Landscape Architect for Cumbernauld New Town. After delivery of the masterplan elements including the Seafar Forest established in response to McHarg's observations on the site, Gillespie founded his practice William Gillespie and Partners (later Gillespies), the author's own practice for 35 years from 1979-2015.

⁴⁶ Evans, B., Tait, S., Kane, K., Ramage, J., Grams, G., and Langlands, I. (2015) *Glasgow - A City of Continuing Traditions*. In: Poszukiwanie modelu inteligentnego miasta. Przykład Gdańska i Glasgow. Monografie ekonomiczne. Wolters Kluwer SA, Warsaw. ISBN 9788326481161

⁴⁷ *A Quest for Life* – p110. In fact Glasgow was awarded and then reigned as European Capital of Culture in 1990 following Athens, Florence, Amsterdam, Berlin and Paris. Not bad for “*a mean, ugly city, a testament to man's inhumanity to man*” (*A Quest for Life* p15).

⁴⁸ Evans, B., *Ripristino ambientale delle area abbandonate: L'esperienza scozzese (Environmental restoration of vacant and derelict areas – The Scottish Experience)*, pp150-161, in Campeol, G. (editor), *La pianificazione nelle area ad alto rischio ambientale (Planning in areas of high environmental risk)* (1994), Francoangeli, Milano.

⁴⁹ Evans, S., 2016, “Greening Central Scotland – Genesis, vision and delivery” in *Growing Awareness: How Green Consciousness can change perceptions and places*, Evans, B. & Evans, S. (editors), RIAS

⁵⁰ *A Quest for Life* –p112 & p151.

⁵¹ Evans, S., 2016, *Op. cit.*

⁵² Is this an exaggeration? In his own inimical style, McHarg claimed in 1970 that “*I had trained the majority of landscape architects, not only in Scotland, but in England, Wales and Ireland as well*”. *A Quest for Life* – p 252.

⁵³ *A Quest for Life* – p112 p151

⁵⁴ The author is indebted to the archives of the University of Pennsylvania for providing access to a list of the UK graduates.

⁵⁵ The Royal Fine Art Commission for Scotland was established in 1927 “*to enquire into such questions of public amenity or of artistic importance relating to Scotland as may be referred to them by any of our Departments of State*”(Excerpt from the Royal Charter for the Royal Fine Art Commission for Scotland), The Countryside Commission was established in 1967 “*to make better provision for the Scottish Countryside*.”. Excerpt from the Countryside (Scotland) Act 1968. Both Commissions remained in place until the early years of the 21st century when the devolved government of Scotland undertook an overhaul of all Scotland's QUANGOs (QUasi-Autonomous National Government Organisations replacing them with NDPBs (Non-Departmental Public Bodies)

⁵⁶ The author had the good fortune to collaborate with both Steedman and Turnbull over a period of 30 years. As a Countryside Commissioner, Steedman oversaw the research that Gillespies undertook into the setting of buildings into the landscape published in 1991 as *Tomorrow's Architectural Heritage: The landscape Setting of Buildings in the Countryside* (Fladmark, J., Mulvagh, G., & Evans, B. [1991] Mainstream). With a foreword by HRH The Prince of Wales, this book changed the paradigm for the manner by which Scotland's rural buildings were designed and integrated into the landscape. *Tomorrow's Architectural Heritage* informed the publication of a trilogy of Planning Advice Notes published as policy by the Government in Scotland: *No 36: Buildings in the countryside* (1991), *No44: The Landscape Setting of Development in the Countryside* (1994) and *No52: Small Towns* (1996).

With Turnbull, the author established a 25-year collaboration in computer-aided landscape design and regional landscape studies. The collaboration was founded on the belief that emerging computer-aided techniques in landscape design could greatly assist the delivery of the precepts of *Design With Nature*. Early work and publications in association with the University of Strathclyde (ABACUS - Architecture and Building Aids Computer Unit Strathclyde) and the University of Edinburgh (EdCAAD (Edinburgh Computer-Aided Architectural Design)) led on to the establishment of methods for the routing of linear developments through the landscape

notably electricity transmission lines for the South of Scotland electricity Board, later Scottish Power (Scottish Power, 1992), now the subject of a PhD research program at MIT.

⁵⁷ In 2011, the then President of the Russian Federation enacted a decree to extend the city of Moscow by some 175,000 sq km to the south west of the city. Thereafter a decision was taken by the President and the Mayor of Moscow to stage an international design competition with three strategic outcomes: a spatial commentary on the structure of the Moscow Region, a spatial plan for the new city extension area; and, a masterplan for a new federal administrative centre in the south west expansion area. Ten teams were selected to participate: Two French, one Anglo-American, one Spanish, one Italian, one Dutch, one Russo-Japanese and two Russian. Two prizes were awarded: one to the Anglo-American team led by Urban Design Associates (Pittsburgh USA) and Gillespies (Glasgow UK) and one to the French team led by the Wilmotte and Grumbach studios.

The competition and its outcomes have been extensively documented most notably in a theme issue of the magazine *Project Russia* entitled *Greater Moscow* (большая москва/Greater Moscow, проект Россия/Project Russia, no 66, 4/2012). A number of articles in English have been published by the author: Evans, B., *Competition for the Expansion of Moscow*, in *Water Landscapes*, TOPOS – the International Review of Landscape Architecture & Urban Design, No81, Munich, 2012; Evans, B., *The Ecology of the Periphery*, in *The Archaeology of the Periphery*, Project Meganom/Strelka Institute, Moscow Urban Forum, 2013; Evans, B., *Moscow Metropolis – Edge City*, *MacMag39*, Mackintosh School of Architecture, pp160-161, 2014; Evans, B., *Moscow River a Living Environment*, in *Resilient Cities & Landscapes*, TOPOS – the International Review of Landscape Architecture & Urban Design, No90, Munich, 2015;

⁵⁸ Steiner & Steedman, Op. cit.

⁵⁹ See in particular ‘A Scot in America’, *A Quest for Life*, pp348-349.

⁶⁰ Extract (author’s emphasis) from the citation by President George H W Bush on conferring the National Medal of Arts on Ian L McHarg in 1999. A statement that McHarg was rightly proud of and one he reproduced in the preface to the 25th Anniversary edition of *Design With Nature* (1991) and in the conclusion to his autobiography *A Quest for Life* (1996) ... although with characteristic panache the quotation is different in the two books!